

SCIENCE ADVISORY PANEL

Tuesday, 28th of January 2014 at 1:00 PM

AGENDA

- 1. MEMBERSHIP**
1.1 Apologies for absence Paper 1 attached
- 2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
- 3. CONSIDERATION OF THE T.O.R. FOR THE SCIENCE ADVISORY PANEL** Paper 2 attached
- 4. MODUS OPERANDUM: DISCUSSION OF HOW THE PANEL WILL WORK** Paper 3 attached
- 5. A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW FOR INTERVENTIONS FOR BOVINE TB** Paper 4 attached
Request from the Past Presidents Group
- 6. FELINE RENAL TRANSPLANTS** Confidential
Request from the Standards Committee
- 7. OTHER TOPICS FOR CONSIDERATION**
- 8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**
- 9. DATE OF NEXT MEETINGS**
Tuesday, May 6th 2014
Tuesday, 7th October 2014

Dr. Rita Jorge
Head of Research
RCVS Knowledge
rita@rcvsknowledge.org

Meeting	Science Advisory Panel
Date	28 th January 2014
Title	Membership of the Science Advisory Panel
Classification	Unclassified
Summary	Membership of the Science Advisory Panel
Decisions required	None
Attachments	Paper 1 – Membership of the Science Advisory Panel
Author(s)	Dr. Rita Jorge Head of Research, RCVS Knowledge r.jorge@rcvs.org.uk

Membership

SCIENCE ADVISORY PANEL: LIST OF MEMBERS 2014

NAME	POSITION
Professor The Lord Trees	Chair of the Science Advisory Panel
Professor Elizabeth Simpson	Royal Society
Dr. Michael Francis	Executive Director, Research & Development at MSD Animal Health
Professor Dirk Pfeiffer	Royal Veterinary College
Dr. Tim Nuttall	The Royal (Dick) School of Veterinary Studies, Edinburgh
Professor Ewan Cameron	University of Glasgow
Ms. Andrea Jeffery	Veterinary Nurses Council
Ms. Jacqui Molyneaux	RCVS Ex-president
Dr. Bradley Viner	RCVS Treasurer
Mr. Nick Royle (ex-officio)	Executive Director, RCVS Knowledge

Committee Secretary:

Dr. Rita Jorge
Head of Research
RCVS Knowledge
rita@rcvsknowledge.org

Meeting	Science Advisory Panel
Date	28 th January 2014
Title	Terms of Reference for the Science Advisory Panel
Classification	Unclassified
Summary	The Sub-committee is asked to consider the terms of reference laid out in the attached paper.
Decisions required	Approval of the terms of reference
Attachments	Paper 2 – Terms of reference for the Science Advisory Panel
Author(s)	Dr. Rita Jorge Head of Research, RCVS Knowledge r.jorge@rcvs.org.uk

Science Advisory Panel

Terms of Reference

1. The Science Advisory Panel shall provide the scientific underpinning for RCVS functions, and in particular:
 - Advise on scientific issues relevant to the professional conduct of veterinary surgeons;
 - Advise on research-related issues relevant to the education of veterinary students in UK veterinary schools;
 - Advise on scientific issues relevant to recognised veterinary practice;
 - protect the interests of those dependent on animals and assure public health by ensuring that the debate on veterinary issues is based on good evidence and sound advice; and
 - Advise on scientific issues at the request of Council or any of its committees or subcommittees.
2. The Science Advisory Panel shall report to the Operational Board.

Meeting	Science Advisory Panel
Date	28 th January 2014
Title	Modus Operandum: discussion of how the panel will work
Classification	Unclassified
Summary	The Science Advisory Panel is meeting for the first time. As such, it is relevant that its members are aware of the scheme of delegation from the RCVS council to the committees (attached) and that there is an opportunity to discuss how the committee will choose its agenda and what will be its methods of doing business and interacting with its stakeholders.
Decisions required	Agreement on a set of rules and procedures for the functioning of the advisory panel.
Attachments	Paper 3 – Scheme of delegation from the RCVS Council to Treasurer, Operational Board and committees
Author(s)	Dr. Rita Jorge Head of Research, RCVS Knowledge r.jorge@rcvs.org.uk

Scheme of delegation from the RCVS Council to Treasurer, Operational Board and committees

Operative date

1. The following delegations shall have effect from 5 July 2013.

Treasurer

2. The Treasurer shall be responsible for the financial affairs of the College, including the proper maintenance of its accounting records and the preparation of the College's accounts for audit and presentation to the Annual General Meeting.

Operational Board

3. There shall be an Operational Board consisting of the President; the Vice-Presidents; the Treasurer; the Chairmen of the Education Committee, Standards Committee and Veterinary Nurses' Council; the Secretary; and the Registrar. It shall report to Council. The Secretary shall be the chairman of the Operational Board.
4. The Operational Board shall oversee the management of all College business and oversee matters of governance and the management of resources. In particular it shall:
 - present a strategic plan to Council for approval each year;
 - present an annual business plan and budget to Council for approval and recommend proposed fee changes;
 - ensure that the strategic and annual plans and budget are implemented, within limits of variation approved by Council;
 - lay down procedures for budgeting and financial control;
 - approve expenditure from the contingency fund;
 - seek the approval of Council for expenditure from the College's reserves;
 - manage the assets and investments of the College;
 - manage organisational risks, maintain a risk register and oversee internal audit reviews;
 - oversee the appointment of professional advisers to the College;
 - approve rates of travelling and subsistence expenses and recompense for loss of earnings;
 - authorise the sealing of documents;
 - advise Council on corporate governance matters, including the terms of reference and composition of committees;
 - co-ordinate the work of committees;
 - approve the setting up sub-committees, working parties and other such bodies and determine their members;

- keep under review arrangements for Council elections;
- recommend to Council the names of persons for election as Honorary Associates and Honorary Fellowships of the College and for the award of prizes, in accordance with the Honours, Awards and Membership Bye-Laws; and
- determine external representation and conduct external relations.

Committees

5. There shall be the following statutory and appeals committees:

- the Disciplinary Committee (statutory committee);
- the Examination Appeals Committee (appeals committee);
- the Preliminary Investigation Committee (statutory committee);
- the Registration Appeals Committee (statutory appeals committee); and
- the Specialist Recognition Appeals Committee (appeals committee).

6. There shall be the following other committees:

- the Audit and Risk Committee;
- the Education Policy and Specialisation Committee;
- the Preliminary Investigation Committee and Disciplinary Committee Liaison Committee;
- the Science Advisory Panel;
- the Standards Committee; and
- the Veterinary Nurses' Council.

7. The committees shall report to Council and shall be constituted and work within the terms of reference set out below.

8. The committees may appoint one or more sub-committees for such general or special purpose as they may think fit, subject to the approval of the Operational Board, and, subject to any contrary direction from the Council, may on behalf of the Council delegate to such sub-committees power to act in the name of the College and the Council in relation to the matters set out in their terms of reference.

Audit and Risk Committee

9. The Audit and Risk Committee shall support the Council by reviewing the comprehensiveness and reliability of assurances and internal controls in meeting the Council's oversight

responsibilities. The Committee is a non-executive committee and has no executive powers except as set out below.

10. The Committee has delegated authority to:

- monitor the Council's risk management arrangements;
- approve the internal audit programme; and
- advise the Council on the comprehensiveness and reliability of assurances and internal controls, including internal and external audit arrangements, and on the implications of assurances provided in respect of risk and control.

11. The Committee may request the attendance of any employee or member, as set out in paragraph 23 below, and may incur expenditure for the purpose of obtaining advice in terms of paragraph 27 below.

12. The Committee is accountable to the Council. The minutes of each Committee meeting shall be circulated to the Council. The Committee shall report to the Council annually on its work. It may also submit separately to the Council its advice on issues where it considers that the Council should take action. Where the Committee considers there is evidence of ultra vires transactions or evidence of improper acts, the chairman of the Committee shall raise the matter at a formal Council meeting.

13. The Committee shall have five members, but may operate with fewer while a vacancy exists, provided the quorum is maintained. The members shall include two Council members, of whom one shall be a lay member and one a registrant member. The President, a Vice-President and the Treasurer shall not be members of the Committee. The members of the Committee who are not Council members (the "external members") shall have appropriate audit and risk management experience.

14. The Council will appoint one of the external members serving on the Committee as chairman, based on relevant background and skills. In the absence of the chairman, the Committee shall elect another of its members to chair the meeting.

15. The Committee shall support the Council by reviewing and advising the Council on the operation and effectiveness of the arrangements which are in place across the whole of the Council's activities that support the achievement of the Council's objectives. In particular, the Committee shall review the adequacy of:-

- all risk and control related disclosure statements, together with any accompanying internal audit statement, external audit opinion or other appropriate independent assurances, prior to endorsement by the Council;
- the underlying assurance processes that indicate the degree of the achievement of corporate objectives, the effectiveness of the management of principal risks and the appropriateness of the above disclosure statements;

- the policies for ensuring compliance with relevant regulatory, legal, governance and code of conduct requirements; and

- the policies and procedures for all work related to fraud and corruption.

16. In carrying out this work the Committee will primarily utilise the work of internal audit, external audit and other assurance functions. It will also seek reports and assurances from Department Managers as appropriate, concentrating on the over-arching systems of governance, risk management and internal control together with indicators of their effectiveness.

17. In reviewing risk management arrangements, the Committee shall draw attention to areas where:

- risk is being appropriately managed and controls are adequate (no action needed);

- risk is inadequately controlled (action needed to improve control);

- risk is over-controlled (resource being wasted which could be diverted to another use); and

- there is a lack of evidence to support a conclusion (if this concerns areas which are material to the organisation's functions, more audit and/or assurance work will be required).

18. In relation to internal audit the Committee shall:

- ensure that there is an effective internal audit function that complies with any applicable standards and provides appropriate independent assurance to the Council, Audit and Risk Committee, Secretary and Registrar;

- consider the appointment of the internal auditors, the cost of the service and any questions of resignation or dismissal and make appropriate recommendations to the Council;

- ensure that the Manager of Human Resources makes adequate resource available to the internal audit function;

- review the internal audit strategy, operational plan and work programme;

- consider the major findings of internal audit work, and management's response;

- ensure co-ordination between the internal and external auditors; and

- annually review the effectiveness of internal audit.

19. In relation to external audit the Committee shall:

- consider the appointment and performance of the external auditor, the audit fee and any questions of resignation or dismissal and make appropriate recommendations to the Council;

- discuss and agree with the external auditor, before the audit commences, the nature and scope of the audit as set out in the external audit plan and their local evaluation of audit risks;
- review the work and findings of the external auditor, consider the implications and management's responses to their work; and
- review all external audit reports, including agreement of the annual audit letter before submission to the Council and any work undertaken outside the annual audit plan, together with the appropriateness of management responses.

20. The Committee shall review the annual financial statements, focusing particularly on:

- the statement on internal control and other disclosures relevant to the terms of reference of the Committee;
- changes in, and compliance with, accounting policies and practices;
- unadjusted mis-statements in the financial statements;
- major judgmental areas; and
- significant adjustments resulting from the audit.

21. The Committee shall ensure that the systems for financial reporting to the Council, including those of budgetary control, are subject to review as to completeness and accuracy of the information provided to the Council.

22. The Committee shall meet not less than three times a year. The external or internal auditors may request a meeting if they consider that one is necessary.

23. Only Committee members shall be entitled to attend meetings of the Committee. The Secretary and/or the Registrar, Head of Finance and representatives from the internal auditors shall normally attend meetings. Representatives from the external auditors shall attend meetings as required for relevant items. The President and other Council members may attend meetings at the invitation of, or with the agreement of, the chairman of the Committee.

24. The Committee may request any employee or member to attend a meeting to assist with its discussions on any particular matter or to provide any information it may reasonably require in order to fulfil its remit. All employees and members shall co-operate with any reasonable request made by the Committee.

25. The Committee may ask any or all non-members to withdraw for all or part of a meeting if it so decides. In such an instance, the Chairman shall ensure that a proper record is made of the meeting.

26. The senior representatives of internal audit and external audit shall have free and confidential access to the chairman of the Committee. At least once a year, the Committee shall provide an opportunity to meet privately with the external and internal auditors.
27. The Committee may investigate any activity within its terms of reference. It may seek any information it requires from any employee and all employees shall co-operate with any request made by the Committee.
28. The Committee may obtain legal or other independent professional advice and secure the attendance of external advisers with relevant experience and expertise if it considers this necessary, within the budget approved by the Council. The Secretary and/or Registrar shall ensure that appropriate secretariat support is provided to the Chairman and Committee.

Disciplinary Committee

29. The Disciplinary Committee shall be constituted in accordance with Schedule 2 to the Veterinary Surgeons Act 1966.

Education Committee

30. The Education Committee shall set the policy for undergraduate and postgraduate education and training of veterinary surgeons and determine the requirements for those seeking registration, for the award of qualifications under the Charter, for continuing professional development, and for recognition as RCVS Advanced Practitioner and RCVS Specialist.
31. The Committee shall develop and keep under review education and training requirements for registration, and in particular shall:
 - define "day 1 competences" and advise on the content of the veterinary undergraduate curriculum;
 - oversee the approval process and ongoing monitoring of veterinary degrees and international recognition agreements, considering sub-committee reports on appointment of visitors, visitation reports, follow-up reports and annual monitoring reports from veterinary schools, sub-committee reports on overseas degrees from other accrediting bodies, and sub-committee reports on operation of the statutory membership examination; and
 - make recommendations to Council on any change in approved status concerning registrable degrees, on the regulations governing the statutory membership examination, and on the regulations governing practice by students.
32. The Committee shall develop and keep under review policy for continuing professional development, revalidation and postgraduate training and qualifications, and in particular shall:
 - define "year 1 competences" and monitor the postgraduate development phase;

- set the requirements for and monitor continuing professional development within the profession;
- develop and maintain a framework of College postgraduate awards, receiving reports from sub-committees on the standards for College-awarded certificates, diplomas and fellowships, examinations and accreditation of other recognised postgraduate qualifications as part of the framework;
- define the requirements for RCVS Advanced Practitioner and RCVS Specialist status, receiving reports from sub-committees on the maintenance of lists for Advanced Practitioners and Specialists; and
- recommend to Council amendments to the certificate and diploma and Fellowship bye-laws.

33. The Committee shall recommend fees to the Operational Board for candidates, examiners and visitors, Advanced Practitioners, Specialists and Fellows.

Examination Appeals Committee

34. The Examination Appeals Committee shall deal with appeals relating to the conduct of examinations administered by the College, in accordance with the relevant regulations and bye-laws.

Preliminary Investigation Committee

35. The Preliminary Investigation Committee shall be constituted in accordance with Schedule 2 to the Veterinary Surgeons Act 1966.

Preliminary Investigation Committee and Disciplinary Committee Liaison Committee

36. The Preliminary Investigation Committee and Disciplinary Committee Liaison Committee shall consist of:

- the Chairman of the Preliminary Investigation Committee;
- the Chairman of the Disciplinary Committee; and
- the President and two other members of Council.

37. The Preliminary Investigation Committee and Disciplinary Committee Liaison Committee shall provide guidance on regulatory issues.

38. The Preliminary Investigation Committee and Disciplinary Committee Liaison Committee shall report to the Operational Board.

Registration Appeals Committee

39. The Registration Appeals Committee shall be constituted in accordance with section 5D of the Act and the Veterinary Surgeons (Registration Appeals) Rules 2008.

Science Advisory Panel

40. The Science Advisory Panel shall provide the scientific underpinning for RCVS functions, and in particular:

- advise on scientific issues relevant to the professional conduct of veterinary surgeons;
- advise on research-related issues relevant to the education of veterinary students in UK veterinary schools;
- advise on scientific issues relevant to recognised veterinary practice;
- protect the interests of those dependent on animals and assure public health by ensuring that the debate on veterinary issues is based on good evidence and sound advice; and
- advise on scientific issues at the request of Council or any of its committees or subcommittees.

41. The Science Advisory Panel shall report to the Operational Board.

Specialist Recognition Appeals Committee

42. The Specialist Recognition Appeals Committee shall determine appeals relating to specialist recognition after reviewing the original papers considered by the first instance sub-committee or committee.

Standards Committee

43. The Standards Committee shall provide advice and guidance on the professional conduct of veterinary surgeons and veterinary nurses, and in particular:

- publish a Code or Codes of Professional Conduct, subject to the approval of the Council;
- publish as necessary advice on professional conduct in "RCVS News" and RCVSONline;
- respond to professional conduct issues raised by the Preliminary Investigation Committee (not involving specific cases or named individuals) or Veterinary Nurses' Council, to issues raised by the Disciplinary Committee and, as agreed by the chairman, to requests for advice from members of the profession;
- oversee the development of the RCVS Practice Standards Scheme by the Practice Standards Group, making recommendations to Council as appropriate, and considering appeals from the Practice Standards Scheme Review Group; and
- deal with all matters relating to registration and membership of the College.

Veterinary Nurses' Council

44. The Veterinary Nurses' Council shall consist of the following members:

- two members of the Council, to be appointed by the Council, and a maximum of two veterinary surgeons (whether or not members of the Council), to be appointed by the Veterinary Nurses' Council;
- eight veterinary nurses practising or living wholly or mainly in the United Kingdom, elected by ballot of all veterinary nurses, conducted substantially in accordance with the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons Council Election Scheme 1967 (as amended), with the necessary adaptations; and
- four lay members, to be appointed by the Veterinary Nurses' Council.

45. The chairman of the Professions Allied to Veterinary Science Industry Group of the Sector Skills Council (LANTRA), or its successor committee, or that person's nominee, may be co-opted as an additional member of the Veterinary Nurses' Council.

46. The term of office of elected and appointed members of the Veterinary Nurses' Council shall be four years in each case, and one-quarter of the elected members shall retire in rotation each year, being eligible for re-election if still qualified to serve. A member elected or appointed to fill a casual vacancy shall serve the unexpired portion of the predecessor's term of office.

47. The quorum for meetings of the Veterinary Nurses' Council shall be seven members, which must include four veterinary nurse members, two veterinary surgeon members (one of whom must be a member of the Council), and one lay member.

48. The chairman and two vice-chairmen of the Veterinary Nurses' Council shall be elected by the Veterinary Nurses' Council, by secret ballot, provided that where the person elected as chairman is a veterinary surgeon or lay member at least one vice-chairman shall be a veterinary nurse. The election of the chairman shall be confirmed by the RCVS Council.

49. The term of office of the chairman shall be either two or three years and vice-chairmen shall serve for either one or three years, with the outgoing chairman normally serving one year as vice-chairman.

50. The Veterinary Nurses' Council may also elect a Finance Officer from amongst its number to oversee the financial affairs relating to the veterinary nursing activities of the College and to work alongside the College Treasurer.

51. The Veterinary Nurses' Council shall:

- maintain the list of veterinary nurses referred to in Schedule 3 to the Act;
- establish and keep under review standards of proficiency for safe and effective veterinary nursing practice, including requirements for admission to the list of veterinary nurses and the training and examinations to be undertaken;

- ensure compliance with the requirements of the relevant regulatory authorities relating to vocational qualifications in veterinary nursing;
- establish and keep under review standards of good character and conduct required for listed veterinary nurses and develop a voluntary system of regulation;
- establish and keep under review schemes for post-qualification training and continuing professional development for veterinary nurses, and the outcomes to be achieved, with a view to recording an additional entry in the list mentioned in Schedule 3 to the Act;
- recommend to the Operational Board a budget and levels of fees to be charged for awarding body functions, qualification, listing and post qualification diplomas;
- recommend to the Council amendments to the Veterinary Nursing Bye-Laws and Advanced Veterinary Nursing Bye-Laws; and
- oversee the work of the Awarding Body Management Board.

52. In exercising its functions, the Veterinary Nurses' Council shall ensure that the welfare of animals and good veterinary practice are central to its work.

Meeting	Science Advisory Panel
Date	28 th January 2014
Title	A systematic review for interventions for Bovine TB: request from the Past Presidents Group
Classification	Unclassified
Summary	The past presidents group requests that the Science Advisory Panel takes the lead on behalf of the RCVS in performing a systematic review of the evidence behind the different interventions for bovine TB.
Decisions required	Response to provide to the Past Presidents Group
Attachments	Paper 4 – Letter from Professor Sheila Crispin, on behalf of the Past Presidents Group
Author(s)	Dr. Rita Jorge Head of Research, RCVS Knowledge r.jorge@rcvs.org.uk

A systematic review for interventions for Bovine TB: request from the Past Presidents Group

Background

1. The Past Presidents Group is an informal group that meets twice a year at the RCVS, to discuss points of interest to the RCVS.
2. At its last November meeting, group members felt that there was a need for a systematic review of the evidence behind interventions for bovine tuberculosis. The science advisory panel was seen as the natural lead for this endeavour.
3. A letter was written to the Advisory Panel Chairman by Professor Sheila Crispin on behalf of the group requesting that this advisory panel discuss the possibility of engaging in a systematic review.
4. Letter below:

“Dear Sandy

You will have seen that Roger (Eddy) had, as one of his agenda items at the Past-Presidents’ dinner, ‘*Bovine tuberculosis and the RCVS*’. When this matter was discussed by those present, it was clear that the best agreed approach might well be a systematic review of the disparate evidence by the College’s Science Advisory Panel which you chair.

Whilst there is no underestimating the immensity and complexity of this task, as no single body has looked at and evaluated all the evidence (domestic hosts, wildlife reservoirs, disease transmission, husbandry, nutrition, testing regimes, immune status, health and welfare aspects, zoonotic potential, lessons from human TB etc) there are plenty of external experts who would be willing to assist and it might present the ideal opportunity for the College to really stake a claim to being an impartial source of good science. It is possible that the Royal Society might also wish to be involved.

[edited]

Best wishes

Sheila Crispin

5. Members are requested to discuss this possibility, in light of the Science Advisory Panel’s terms of reference and *modus operandi*.